

Page 1/6

To:
Steven Rosen, Associate Planner
City of Napa
1600 1st St,
Napa, CA 94559

Subject:
Secretary of the Interior's Standards - Consistency Analysis
Elm House Inn Annex
2337 Second Street
Napa, CA 94559

APN: 004-493-002-000
General Plan: TRI-144
Zoning Code: RT 4

October 14, 2020

Dear Steven,

This memorandum constitutes an analysis of the ability for work proposed under the "Elm House Inn Annex" General Plan Amendment Project to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the extent to which the proposed modifications may or may not affect the historic integrity of the resource.

The subject property at 2337 Second Street in Napa features a vernacular cottage (c.1900) and accessory shed building (c.1924). The property is listed on the City of Napa's Historic Resource Master List and identified as a contributor to the potential "West Napa" historic district. Per the "West Napa Historic Context & Survey Report" prepared by Page & Turnbull in 2010, the property was given a California Historical Resource Status Code of 3D and 5D3, meaning that the resource appears eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) as a Contributor to a NR eligible district through survey evaluation and also appears to be a Contributor to a District that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation.

707.812.8728
lilly@lillybianco.com
lillybianco.com

PO Box 3244
Napa, CA 94558

Background (Excerpted from "West Napa Historic Context & Survey Report)

The subject property includes a 1,206 sf vernacular residence and 608 sf shed located in the southwest corner of the property. Based on available records, it appears the residence was constructed at the turn of the century and the accessory shed structure, at some point after 1924. By the turn of the twentieth century, Napa had established itself as a self-sufficient town with strong agricultural roots and by 1905, the City supported a population of about 5,500 people. The area of West Napa, in which the subject property is located, was relatively slow to develop during this time period and while it featured a variety of Victorian era Cottages and mansions, these were interspersed with large agricultural parcels. Most residents of this area included middle- and upper-class merchants and professionals. The introduction of the interurban railroad in 1905 further spurred development throughout the area.

Property History

Based on available City directories and Assessor's records, it appears the property was originally owned by Mr. John Litz from the years 1904-1942. Mr. Litz was reported to be a laborer and well-known gambler (Napa Daily Journal May 1897). In 1947, the property was deeded to John Albert Litz, son of John Litz. With his brother Louis, he began a firm dealing in the wholesale and retail fruit business known by the name of Litz Bros. (Napa Register October 1958). In 1960, Bert and Goldie Farmer acquired the property. Mr. Farmer was a glass mechanic that owned and operated the Harris Glass and Body Shop on Yajome Street. In 1974, Bert and Suzanne sold the property and moved to El Centro Avenue in Napa. In the late 1970s the residence was converted to offices and has continued to operate as such until the present day.

Architectural Description

Residence:

The turn of the century residence is one-story vernacular cottage. Set atop a newer concrete stem wall foundation, the building walls are clad in horizontal wood siding, punctuated with simple double hung windows and the building is capped with a hipped roof. The façade features an almost full width porch



and a wooden entry door with transom flanked on either side by simple double hung windows. The left elevation features a bay window. Based on review of available Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps, a small addition was added to the rear at some point between 1924 and 1949. Character defining features of the residence include: the modest size, location in West Napa, early twentieth century architectural style and form, set back from lot line, location on a smaller, closely spaced lot, one-story height, wood-frame construction, hip roof, wood cladding, simple wood ornamentation, wood-sash windows and wood door.

Accessory Building:

The subject property features a single-story accessory shed building located along the southwest property line. The wood framed structure is clad in vertical board and batten siding and capped with a shed roof. As indicated by the Sanborn Fire maps, at some point between 1924–1949, the current shed building replaced an earlier structure that operated as auto/storage unit. During the intervening years between 1924 and 1949, there also appeared a small attached wing on the accessory structure that featured an address of 2337 ½ Second Street. The attached wing is no longer extant.

SANBORN FIRE INSURANCE MAPS - Property Evolution					
2337 Second Street					
Date	Sheet	Address	House	Accessory Building	Notes
1891		Ornduff and Second Street	Not shown	Not shown	Part of Ornduff Tract. Located outside of incorporate Napa
1901	12	1200-1315 block of Second Street	Constructed (c.1900)	(2x) Two-story (B) basement	
1910	16	1337 Second Street		(2) Two-story; (OUT HO) Outer House	
1924	17	2337 Second Street		(2 x) Two-story (A) automobile	
Jan.1924-Aug.1949	17	2337 Second Street	Possible rear addition	(1) One-story (A) automobile & (stge) storage. No chimney. New addition on West side (1) One-story with new address.	Second address listed as 2337 1/2 Second Street.

Significance

The review of available records confirms that the property is a Contributor to the Potential West Napa District. In West Napa, development during the early twentieth century (1900-1919) is important because the building boom that occurred during this period continued the residential development patterns established in the Victorian era. The arrival of the interurban electric railroad on Jefferson Street in 1905 was also a major force that shaped the development of West Napa during this period, raising property values and encouraging construction along the route.

Per the West Napa Survey, prepared by Page & Turnbull, early twentieth century cottages and dwellings in West Napa are likely to be significant because they demonstrate the type of residential development influenced by the interurban electric railroad, and possibly because they are examples of the Craftsman or Shingle style, or an architect's or builder's work. A modest dwelling or cottage from the early twentieth century would likely be significant under NRHP Criterion A (Events, Patterns and Trends) as a representation of the survey area's continuing development as a middle- to upper-class residential area. Residences associated with outbuildings would be especially significant under this criterion for their association with development when the neighborhood was semi-rural and lacked modern infrastructure.

The residence on the property appears to be significant under Criterion A and continues to retain important character defining features and overall historic integrity. As noted in the West Napa Historic Context, many modest dwellings and cottages from the early twentieth century include associated ancillary buildings. These outbuildings derive their significance from the significance of the dwelling and are typically *not* eligible in their own right.

Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards

As detailed in the project plans, dated October 14, 2020, the proposed exterior modifications include a small (47 sf) addition to the rear elevation along with reconstructing the rear porch to accommodate a new chair lift and steps, and the removal of the existing shed outbuilding to improve the functionality of the outdoor space in the context of the larger project.

Per the Secretary of the Interior's Standard's 2017 Treatment Guidelines and to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, additions should generally be conducted in accordance with the following:

- *Constructing a new addition on a secondary or non-character defining elevation and limiting its size and scale in relationship to the historic building.*
- *Constructing a new addition that results in the least possible loss of historic materials so that character-defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.*
- *Designing a new addition that is compatible with the historic building.*

- *Ensuring that the addition is subordinate and secondary to the historic building and is compatible in massing, scale, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and color.*

As detailed in project plans, the proposed addition is situated on a secondary elevation, not readily visible from the public way, and would be compatible and subordinate to the original building. The addition would be inconspicuous whilst allowing for the adaptive reuse and rehabilitation of the building. The proposed modification therefore is not expected to have an adverse impact on the integrity of the residence and would comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

The proposed removal of the accessory shed building would likewise not adversely impact the integrity of the property. As the shed was constructed much later than the residence, at some point between 1924 and 1949, and is not found to be historic in its own right, its removal would not impact the property's ability to convey its significance and integrity would be maintained.

Based on review of proposed Project in light of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and relevant Treatment Guidelines, the proposed modifications and demolition of the accessory shed appear to be sympathetic to the historic character defining features of the resource and would be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The integrity of the resource would therefore not be adversely affected, and the property would continue to be eligible for the listing as a Contributor the Potential West Napa Historic District.

Please do not hesitate to reach out should you have any questions or wish to discuss further.

Kind Regards,



Lilly Bianco

Consistency Analysis
Elm House Inn Annex
2337 Second Street

Reviewer's Qualifications

Lilly Bianco has ten years of experience working in the field of architectural history. She holds a Masters in Historic Preservation and is a qualified Architectural Historian pursuant to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and as defined in the Code of Federal Regulations, 36 CFR Part 61. Ms. Bianco is listed as an Architectural Historian on the California Historic Resources Information Systems list of qualified consultants.