

SUPPLEMENTAL REPORTS & COMMUNICATIONS II
Office of the City Clerk

City Council of the City of Napa
Regular Meeting
August 18, 2020

FOR THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NAPA:

EVENING SESSION:

13. ADMINISTRATIVE REPORTS:

13.A. Presentation about Reproductive Rights Regulation of Protests on and Public Access to Sidewalks Near Reproductive Health Care Facilities.

- Email from Michelle Ruth received on August 18, 2020. *
- Email from Kathi Rogers received on August 19, 2020.

****EMAIL OR HANDWRITTEN COMMENTS WILL BE READ INTO THE RECORD BY CITY STAFF DURING THE MEETING.***

From: [REDACTED]
To: [Clerk; Robert Plummer](#)
Subject: COMMENT TO COUNCIL FOR AUGUST 18, 2020 CITY COUNCIL MEETING - PLEASE READ
Date: Tuesday, August 18, 2020 8:15:30 PM

[EXTERNAL]

This women's email can't get pass your server:

I am an African-American woman, a Napa resident, and a beginning medical student. For many years, I have joined fellow pro-life students and young adults in front of Planned Parenthood in Napa. There has been a prayer witness there for decades.

The idea that women entering the Planned Parenthood center are harmed by this peaceful presence is absolutely ludicrous. Pro-lifers do not obstruct the sidewalk or do anything to prevent clients from entering. Pro-lifers don't shout obscenities or challenges. Most of them are just there quietly praying. Sometimes there is a sidewalk counselor present who offers help in the form of pregnancy support.

Sidewalk counselors are always polite and non-threatening because such a demeanor leads to greater success in sidewalk counseling. It is counter-productive to behave in a rude, hostile, or threatening manner.

As a Black woman, I have observed with interest the operation of recent Black Lives Matter protests in the City of Napa. I am of course eager to affirm that Black lives matter. I don't have any objection to the behavior of BLM protesters in Napa.

But I note that they have been far louder and more confrontational than pro-life prayer witnesses in front of Napa's Planned Parenthood. As I say, I'm not objecting. BLM protesters have a First Amendment right to be loud. They even have a First Amendment right to be confrontational. However, if their kind of protest is permitted in Napa, if their kind of protest is beyond controversy, then why is the tamer kind of protest practiced by prayer witnesses at Planned Parenthood being stigmatized? The same standard should apply to all. And pro-lifers on Jefferson St. are well within the standard set by other protesters.

Legally, of course, there is no doubt that the First Amendment protects the presence of prayer witnesses on public property. I don't even see Planned Parenthood's reason for seeking a so-called "bubble zone" or the City Council's reason for taking Planned Parenthood's demand seriously. Why does Planned Parenthood get to treat the City Council, the Napa Police Department, and citizens with whom it disagrees as slaves? I'm going into medicine, not law, but it's easy to foresee that the establishment of a "bubble zone" will lead to a legal challenge. Has Planned Parenthood reached some sort of agreement with the City, or with certain officeholders of the City, to defray the costs of litigation on this point? Or are the citizens of Napa, some of whom Planned Parenthood wishes to deprive of their First

Amendment rights, supposed to pay for PP's special treatment?

Any way I look at it, the contemplated "bubble zone" looks like a disaster waiting to happen. I hope the City Council will have the sense not to vote for this disaster.

Michelle Ruth

Mary Riley

From: [Kathi](#)
To: [Clerk](#); [Robert Plummer](#)
Subject: COMMENT TO COUNCIL FOR AUGUST 18, 2020 CITY COUNCIL MEETING - PLEASE READ
Date: Wednesday, August 19, 2020 6:19:01 PM

[EXTERNAL]

Please see below

From: Kathi Rogers<[REDACTED]>
Date: On Wed, Aug 19, 2020 at 10:46 AM
Subject: Fwd: Re: COMMENT TO COUNCIL FOR AUGUST 18, 2020 CITY COUNCIL MEETING - PLEASE READ
To: Clerk@cityofnapa.org
<Clerk@cityofnapa.org>, Rplummer@cityofnapa.org
<Rplummer@cityofnapa.org>
Cc:

I was saddened that my letter wasn't read at the city council meeting last night. I would like to request that it be put in the record now.

Kathi Rogers

On Tue, Aug 18, 2020 at 2:37 PM, Kathi Rogers
[REDACTED] wrote:

I have been a resident of Napa for 22 years. I am the mother of 7 children.

I have been praying in front of Planned Parenthood on Jefferson St in Napa for more than 8 years at each 40 Days for Life campaign which has me sign a statement that I will be peaceful and respectful of all while I am exercising my constitutional right to stand and pray for the unborn babies and their mothers. I have never witnessed any prayer warrior acting intimidating or violent towards anyone.

I am disheartened that Planned Parenthood is trying to make a "bubble zone", which I understand is for high traffic small sidewalks in front of businesses. If you've ever been in front of Planned Parenthood on Jefferson St. in Napa, you would see that it is a super wide sidewalk affording enough room for us to be there and not block anyone from entering their business. I would like to request that you deny this bubble zone.

Thank you.

Kathi Rogers