

Ryder Dilley

---

**From:** Julie Penning [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 1, 2024 5:59 PM  
**To:** Mayra Espinoza  
**Subject:** First and Soscol hotel is too big and ugly

You don't often get email from [REDACTED] [Learn why this is important](#)

[EXTERNAL]

Please reconsider the First and Soscol hotel. The entire Oxbow district needs a central plan. The developers have already built one very ugly hotel, the Cambria. I have been a local resident since 1980. I love the Oxbow Market and appreciate many of the changes and developments to date. However I'm truly horrified at the number of hotels slated to go in.

Thank you,  
Julie Penning

**Ryder Dilley**

---

**From:** Susan Crosby [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 1, 2024 6:26 PM  
**To:** Mayra Espinoza  
**Subject:** no hotel is best, but a smaller hotel is better

You don't often get email from [REDACTED] [Learn why this is important](#)

[EXTERNAL]

Dear Planning Commission,

It's disheartening to hear that the developers are requesting permission for an even larger hotel on the corner of Silverado and Main Street. No hotel is the only good hotel for that site, and a 6 story hotel sounds out of scale and very much out of place -- the phrase "like a sore thumb" comes to mind. A hotel on this scale would destroy our sense of living in a rural area, block views, and add to congestion all with one blow. Yikes.

Please think of your constituents. We need driveable streets and sustainable development only. There are enough hotels and restaurants already... although we should absolutely encourage the addition of more tasting rooms. Just kidding. But that's the almost risible situation we have created as a city.

The hotels want more restaurants; the restaurants want more hotels. This won't end well.

I've been a volunteer with Napa Climate Now! for the past few years and we sat with the creators of the Long Term Plan for our city. The consensus was that any decisions would be made with the climate crisis in mind... What are we thinking with this proposed massive hotel?

Please consider Napa as a home for residents, not a golden goose to be mined for quick tax money. Take a moment to picture Napa in 10 years... 20 years... with climate change the wine industry is under an existential threat; with overdevelopment, our beautiful city is threatened with a surfeit of hotels.

Will we be re-purposing those hotel rooms for our homeless population in a decade or two? There are better solutions.

Please be real planners and think of the next generation.

Here's to a sustainable Napa,  
Susan Crosby



February 2, 2024

Mayor Scott Sedgley  
Vice Mayor Bernie Narvaez  
City Councilmember Beth Painter  
City Councilmember Mary Luros  
City Councilmember Liz Alessio

Via Email:

Dear Mayor and City Councilmembers:

The Napa Housing Coalition is formally requesting that an agenda item be placed on an upcoming City Council Agenda directing City Staff to begin the process recommended in the 2040 General Plan adopted in 2022 to update the DTSP including a specific planning study of the Oxbow District. Currently, the City of Napa has approximately 3,000 hotel rooms with an occupancy rate hovering around 63% and lower in the winter months. It is critical to start addressing the right mix of uses including housing, commercial, hospitality and office.

Before deciding what is needed downtown, we encourage the City of Napa to retain an independent consultant to prepare a Hotel Market Analysis as suggested in the 2040 General Plan looking at:

- 1) The existing hotel market and why it is not rebounding quickly to pre-COVID levels.
- 2) Determine the impact of adding additional rooms to the market such as the Cambria Hotel.
- 3) Include the impact of the development of approved but not yet built hotel projects.
- 4) Include the impact of the number of hotel rooms in process including the South Copia Hotel, First and Oxbow, and Wine Train in this analysis. As has been outlined to the Council in the past, there is the potential of over 1,100 hotel rooms in the Oxbow District alone.
- 5) Consider the hotel rooms being discussed at the Kohl's site, Cinedome and other locations. Further, as an example, a site for a hotel is included in the Napa Pipe approvals.
- 6) Develop a plan for an appropriate number of rooms, preferred timing and locations.
- 7) Make recommendations on how to address the housing needs of below median income workers.

It will take months to prepare and issue a scope of work and hire a consultant to prepare a Hotel Market Analysis that can be used to inform the DTSP update and Oxbow District planning process. We could easily be into 2025 before we have meaningful information. In the meantime, the City of Napa Planning Department continues to process isolated hotel projects, relying on the 2012 DTSP environmental work and not addressing the cumulative impacts. Now is the time to implement the recommendations in the 2040 General Plan! We believe the Agenda Item should also include a discussion of a Moratorium on hotels until these studies are concluded and new guidelines implemented.

Sincerely,

The Napa Housing Coalition Steering Committee - Cass Walker, Judy Myers, Howard Siegel, Chuck Shinnamon

**Summary of Approved, Pending and Under Consideration Hotel Projects in  
Downtown Napa and the Oxbow District 2.5.2024**

<b>Projects Approved But Not Yet Built</b>	<b>Number of Rooms</b>	<b>Location</b>
Napa Ritz Carlton	351	Oxbow District
Black Elk Boutique Hotel	27	Oxbow District
Westin Expansion	32	Oxbow District
Post Office	163	Downtown
Napa River Inn Expansion	24	Downtown
Embassy Suites Expansion	54	Downtown
<b>In Planning Process</b>		
First and Oxbow	123	Oxbow District
South Copia Hotel	170	Oxbow District
Wine Train Hotel	148	Oxbow District
<b>Under Conversation</b>		
Kohl's Block	TBD	Downtown
CineDome	TBD	Downtown
	Total Rooms = 1092	

**From:** [Charles Shinnamon](#)  
**To:** [Clerk](#)  
**Subject:** Update to DTSP and the Oxbow; Hotels  
**Date:** Tuesday, February 6, 2024 8:56:01 AM

---

[EXTERNAL]

Mayor Sedgely and Councilmembers,

I will not be able to attend today's afternoon meeting and I want to briefly share my thoughts. The new General Plan specifically called for an update to the Downtown Specific Plan and for an update and plan for the Oxbow. My strong impression during our GPAC sessions was that these two important issues would be addressed "later" rather than in the middle of the GP update. Given the changes in downtown since 2012 and the pressures facing the Oxbow, now is the time to take a step back and bring these areas into 2024 and beyond.

The ULI Oxbow report and its follow up specifically called for a Vision and Plan for the Oxbow and it also called for an overall parking plan for the Oxbow. If we keep putting these off, all of a sudden, we will wake up and the opportunity will be lost.

Speaking to the issue of hotels: hotels in the downtown and elsewhere have brought many positive results: increases in visitors, serious moneys for our general fund, dramatic increases in downtown activity, etc. But, there always is too much of a good thing. It is time for all of us, you as elected officials, staff, and the overall community to have a real conversation about the number and scope of hotels and hotel rooms in our town.

Thank you all for what you do for all of us!!

Chuck Shinnamon

**Charles W. Shinnamon, P.E.**

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

*"If you don't like the news, go out and make some of your own." (Wes "Scoop" Nisker)*

**From:** [Thomas Bensel](#)  
**To:** [Clerk](#)  
**Subject:** Oxbow District and the DTSP  
**Date:** Tuesday, February 6, 2024 9:38:26 AM  
**Attachments:** [image001.png](#)  
[2.5.2024 NHC Request for GP 2040 Studies.pdf](#)

You don't often get email from [REDACTED] [Learn why this is important](#)

[EXTERNAL]

February 6, 2024

Mayor Scott Sedgley  
Vice Mayor Bernie Narvaez  
City Councilmember Beth Painter  
City Councilmember Mary Luros  
City Councilmember Liz Alessio

Via Email:

Dear Mayor and City Councilmembers:

The Culinary Institute of America, via this email, fully supports the recommendations put forth by the Napa Housing Coalition in the attached letter to the Council dated 2/5/24. We ask that there be a more comprehensive and uniform analysis of the proposed hotels and developments and their related impacts on the Oxbow District. Now is the time to look toward the 2040 General Plan and implement plans/decisions that are beneficial to the entire Oxbow District and all who enjoy its uniqueness.

Thank you for your consideration.

**Thomas Bensel '76**  
Managing Director, CIA California Campus

**The Culinary Institute of America  
at Greystone**  
2555 Main Street, St. Helena, CA 94574  
**The Culinary Institute of America  
At Copia**  
500 First Street, Napa, CA 94559  
[REDACTED]







February 2, 2024

Mayor Scott Sedgley  
Vice Mayor Bernie Narvaez  
City Councilmember Beth Painter  
City Councilmember Mary Luros  
City Councilmember Liz Alessio

Via Email:

Dear Mayor and City Councilmembers:

The Napa Housing Coalition is formally requesting that an agenda item be placed on an upcoming City Council Agenda directing City Staff to begin the process recommended in the 2040 General Plan adopted in 2022 to update the DTSP including a specific planning study of the Oxbow District. Currently, the City of Napa has approximately 3,000 hotel rooms with an occupancy rate hovering around 63% and lower in the winter months. It is critical to start addressing the right mix of uses including housing, commercial, hospitality and office.

Before deciding what is needed downtown, we encourage the City of Napa to retain an independent consultant to prepare a Hotel Market Analysis as suggested in the 2040 General Plan looking at:

- 1) The existing hotel market and why it is not rebounding quickly to pre-COVID levels.
- 2) Determine the impact of adding additional rooms to the market such as the Cambria Hotel.
- 3) Include the impact of the development of approved but not yet built hotel projects.
- 4) Include the impact of the number of hotel rooms in process including the South Copia Hotel, First and Oxbow, and Wine Train in this analysis. As has been outlined to the Council in the past, there is the potential of over 1,100 hotel rooms in the Oxbow District alone.
- 5) Consider the hotel rooms being discussed at the Kohl's site, Cinedome and other locations. Further, as an example, a site for a hotel is included in the Napa Pipe approvals.
- 6) Develop a plan for an appropriate number of rooms, preferred timing and locations.
- 7) Make recommendations on how to address the housing needs of below median income workers.

It will take months to prepare and issue a scope of work and hire a consultant to prepare a Hotel Market Analysis that can be used to inform the DTSP update and Oxbow District planning process. We could easily be into 2025 before we have meaningful information. In the meantime, the City of Napa Planning Department continues to process isolated hotel projects, relying on the 2012 DTSP environmental work and not addressing the cumulative impacts. Now is the time to implement the recommendations in the 2040 General Plan! We believe the Agenda Item should also include a discussion of a Moratorium on hotels until these studies are concluded and new guidelines implemented.

Sincerely,

The Napa Housing Coalition Steering Committee - Cass Walker, Judy Myers, Howard Siegel, Chuck Shinnamon



**From:** [Steve Carlin](#)  
**To:** [Clerk](#)  
**Cc:** [Neal Harrison](#); [Vincent Smith](#)  
**Subject:** The Oxbow / Napa Housing Coalition Recommendations  
**Date:** Tuesday, February 6, 2024 12:14:14 PM  
**Attachments:** [2.5.2024 NHC Request for GP 2040 Studies.pdf](#)

---

You don't often get email from [REDACTED] [Learn why this is important](#)

[EXTERNAL]

February 6, 2024

Mayor Scott Sedgley  
Vice Mayor Bernie Narvaez  
City Councilmember Beth Painter  
City Councilmember Mary Luros  
City Councilmember Liz Alessio

Via Email:

Dear Mayor and Napa City Councilmembers:

I am writing to express support for the recommendations put forth by the Napa Housing Coalition in the attached letter to the Council dated 2/2/24. There is simply too much going on in The Oxbow not to take the important next step of understanding the collective impacts of all the planned or approved developments, largely hotels, in this area. We are certainly not opposed to development in The Oxbow. We welcome responsible and thoughtful additions to this very special slice of Napa. However, without a clear and comprehensive analysis of what future potential development will mean to this area, our community, and the City of Napa, we could easily be jeopardizing what has been accomplished here over the last 20 years if all these projects are built without regard to the whole.

Now is the time to look to the 2040 General Plan and implement plans/decisions that are beneficial to the entire Oxbow District and all who enjoy its uniqueness.

Thank you for your consideration.

Steve Carlin  
Oxbow Public Market



February 2, 2024

Mayor Scott Sedgley  
Vice Mayor Bernie Narvaez  
City Councilmember Beth Painter  
City Councilmember Mary Luros  
City Councilmember Liz Alessio

Via Email:

Dear Mayor and City Councilmembers:

The Napa Housing Coalition is formally requesting that an agenda item be placed on an upcoming City Council Agenda directing City Staff to begin the process recommended in the 2040 General Plan adopted in 2022 to update the DTSP including a specific planning study of the Oxbow District. Currently, the City of Napa has approximately 3,000 hotel rooms with an occupancy rate hovering around 63% and lower in the winter months. It is critical to start addressing the right mix of uses including housing, commercial, hospitality and office.

Before deciding what is needed downtown, we encourage the City of Napa to retain an independent consultant to prepare a Hotel Market Analysis as suggested in the 2040 General Plan looking at:

- 1) The existing hotel market and why it is not rebounding quickly to pre-COVID levels.
- 2) Determine the impact of adding additional rooms to the market such as the Cambria Hotel.
- 3) Include the impact of the development of approved but not yet built hotel projects.
- 4) Include the impact of the number of hotel rooms in process including the South Copia Hotel, First and Oxbow, and Wine Train in this analysis. As has been outlined to the Council in the past, there is the potential of over 1,100 hotel rooms in the Oxbow District alone.
- 5) Consider the hotel rooms being discussed at the Kohl's site, Cinedome and other locations. Further, as an example, a site for a hotel is included in the Napa Pipe approvals.
- 6) Develop a plan for an appropriate number of rooms, preferred timing and locations.
- 7) Make recommendations on how to address the housing needs of below median income workers.

It will take months to prepare and issue a scope of work and hire a consultant to prepare a Hotel Market Analysis that can be used to inform the DTSP update and Oxbow District planning process. We could easily be into 2025 before we have meaningful information. In the meantime, the City of Napa Planning Department continues to process isolated hotel projects, relying on the 2012 DTSP environmental work and not addressing the cumulative impacts. Now is the time to implement the recommendations in the 2040 General Plan! We believe the Agenda Item should also include a discussion of a Moratorium on hotels until these studies are concluded and new guidelines implemented.

Sincerely,

The Napa Housing Coalition Steering Committee - Cass Walker, Judy Myers, Howard Siegel, Chuck Shinnamon

**From:** roger bubel [REDACTED]  
**Date:** February 27, 2024 at 6:33:54 AM PST  
**To:** Scott Sedgley <[ssedgley@cityofnapa.org](mailto:ssedgley@cityofnapa.org)>, Liz Alessio <[lalessio@cityofnapa.org](mailto:lalessio@cityofnapa.org)>, Mary Luros <[mluros@cityofnapa.org](mailto:mluros@cityofnapa.org)>, Beth Painter <[bpainter@cityofnapa.org](mailto:bpainter@cityofnapa.org)>, Bernie Narvaez <[bnarvaez@cityofnapa.org](mailto:bnarvaez@cityofnapa.org)>  
**Subject:** D/T Specific Plan - Oxbow

You don't often get email from [REDACTED] [Learn why this is important](#)

[EXTERNAL]

I am a huge supporter of the Napa City government. I believe your developmental decisions have been excellent & your fiscal responsibility exceptional.

I had several businesses in Downtown pre Flood Control, pre Hotels and the difference is incredible. Downtown is Booming!

The Oxbow area is becoming the center of future development with multiple Hotels and complimentary businesses in the queue. I think, the ability to re-evaluate that would be of benefit and result in better environment for both tourists & locals.

So, I would encourage you to support an update to the Downtown Specific Plan with a focus on the rapidly emerging Oxbow.

Thanks for all your good work

Roger Bubel