

ATTACHMENT 6

RFP #UTILWTR03072019

Pump Stations Replacement
Project No. WTR2018-0011

Date of Final Aggregate Score: 06/06/2019

	Dimension	Possible	GSE	Mountain Cascade	Myers & Sons
Average of all Reviewers	General - Overall quality of the proposal, completeness, responsiveness and readability.	5	4	3	4
	Scope and Schedule - Level of detail and completeness of scope of work, documented understanding of the work to be done, detailed and well thought out schedule, ability to meet the schedule and demonstrated value to the City.	15	12	9	10
	Design Team - Successful experience with similar kinds of work, quality and applicability of references, demonstrated technical ability, firm history, level of experience, qualifications of design team and organization of team.	10	9	8	9
	Water PS Design & Construction - Experience and success of the design-build team with similar projects and permitting.	10	9	8	8
	Construction Team - Successful experience with similar kinds of work, quality and applicability of references, demonstrated technical ability, firm history, level of experience, qualifications of subcontractors for specialty work (concrete, electrical, mechanical, etc.), organization of team, demonstrated value to the City based on results of past projects.	10	8	8	8
	Coordination - Demonstrated understanding of site constraints, daily operation of facility and coordination with City Staff, public interaction, and working hour restrictions.	10	8	7	7
	Contract Price (Alt. B)				
	Relative Cost Comparison	20	16	20	19
	Demonstrated success of Design-Build team to deliver projects on budget with limited change orders	20	14	12	13
	Interview				
	Presentation of the team's experience with potable water pump stations using the design-build delivery method.	30	23	19	28
	Q&A - Ability to respond accurately and completely to specific questions that result from the proposal and/or presentation.	20	17	13	18
Total		150	118.7	107.3	123.2
Alt. A Costs	Hillcrest PS Construction		\$ 1,228,922	\$ 1,108,000	\$ 1,100,000
	Hillcrest PS Design		\$ 316,310	\$ 125,420	\$ 275,000
	Subtotal		\$ 1,545,232	\$ 1,233,420	\$ 1,375,000
	Silverado Highlands PS Construction		\$ 1,223,472	\$ 960,743	\$ 522,000
	Silverado Highlands PS Design		\$ 316,130	\$ 125,420	\$ 275,000
	Subtotal		\$ 1,539,602	\$ 1,086,163	\$ 797,000
	Total		\$ 3,084,834	\$ 2,319,583	\$ 2,172,000
Alt. B Costs	Hillcrest PS Construction		\$ 1,366,100	\$ 1,239,342	\$ 1,164,000
	Hillcrest PS Design		\$ 310,000	\$ 131,420	\$ 235,000
	Subtotal		\$ 1,676,100	\$ 1,370,762	\$ 1,399,000
	Silverado Highlands PS Construction		\$ 1,371,400	\$ 1,114,102	\$ 1,094,000
	Silverado Highlands PS Design		\$ 310,000	\$ 131,420	\$ 235,000
	Subtotal		\$ 1,681,400	\$ 1,245,522	\$ 1,329,000
	Total		\$ 3,357,500	\$ 2,616,284	\$ 2,728,000

*GSE's Cost Proposal Worksheet for Alt. A listed their Total Alternative A as \$3,094,634 this error would not have impacted their overall ranking as the scores were based on Alt. B cost estimates.