



# PLANNING COMMISSION SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES

December 5, 2019

## 1. CALL TO ORDER: 6:00 P.M.

**A. ROLL CALL:** Commissioners – Painter, Kelley, Murray, Oñate

**ABSENT:** Commissioner Huether

**STAFF:** Community Development – Erin Morris, Michael Allen, Patty Baring  
City Attorney's Office – Sabrina Wolfson, Dan Doport

## 2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

## 3. AGENDA REVIEW AND SUPPLEMENTAL REPORTS

The Agenda was approved as submitted.

## 4. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no requests to speak.

## 5. CONSENT CALENDAR

None.

## 6. CONSENT HEARINGS

None.

## 7. PUBLIC HEARINGS/APPEALS

**A. HERITAGE HOUSE/ VALLE VERDE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT AND PROJECT – 3700, 3710 & 3720 VALLE VERDE DRIVE** (File No. PL17-0114) Right-of-Way Abandonment of a portion of the terminus of Valle Verde Drive, a Lot Line Adjustment/Merger, Use Permit, and Design Review applications to remodel an existing building to allow 58-single-room occupancy (SROs) residential units and 8-one bedroom accessible residential units (Heritage House) facility and construction of a new 24-unit apartment complex (Valle Verde) on a 2.88 acre property. The Project also includes a request for three concessions under the State Density Bonus Law, as a 100% affordable housing project.

The property is located at 3700, 3710 & 3720 Valle Verde Drive within the Big Ranch Specific Plan/ Multi-Family Residential (MFR-33H) General Plan Designation and the Multi-Family Residential (RM:FP) Zoning Districts. (APNs 038-170-042, 043 & 046)

Commissioners provided disclosures.

Planning Manager Erin Morris introduced the project and team and provided an overview of the Staff and consultant presentations.

Contract Planner Kathy Pease presented the Staff Report, provided background information related to the application, and provided a recommendation.

Natalie Noyes of David J. Powers and Associates provided background related to the Draft Environmental Impact Report.

Chair Painter invited the Applicant to speak.

Tim Streblow and Larry Florin, on behalf of the Applicant team, provided introductory comments and offered to answer questions on behalf of the Gasser Foundation and Burbank Housing.

Cass Walker briefed the Commission on background relating to the application and offered to answer Commissioner questions.

Chair Painter opened the item for public hearing.

Molly Rattigan of Housing and Homeless Services for Napa County spoke in support of the application.

Larry Kroman, President and CEO of Calistoga Affordable Housing spoke in support of the application.

Maggie Ingalls of Common Ground spoke in support of the application.

Bonnie Richardson, 127 Old Vine Way, spoke in support of the application.

Jenna Boyarde, on behalf of Abode, spoke in support of the application.

Alex Pader of Senator Bill Dodd's Office spoke in support of the application.

Dr. Andrea Clarke, Government Affairs and Policies Committee of the Chamber of Commerce, spoke in support of the application.

Dave Whitmer, 2137 Euclid Avenue, spoke in support of the application.

A member of the public speaking on behalf of Rosemary Vertullo, 103 Summerbrooke Circle, spoke in opposition to the application.

Walter Nygaard, Yountville Veterans Home, spoke in support of the application.

Lynette Collins, 770 Lincoln Avenue, spoke in support of the application.

Karen Garcia, 2336 Clay Street, spoke in support of the application.

Henry Gundling, Resident, spoke in support of the application.

Sharon Macklin, Progressive Women of Napa Valley, spoke in support of the application.

Grania Lindberg, Napa Valley CanDo, spoke in support of the application.

Steven Boyd, Clinical Director, spoke in support of the application.

Bill Chadwick, Veteran's advocate of the Napa County Housing Commission, spoke in support of the application.

Joelle Gallagher, Napa Housing Coalition, spoke in support of the application.

Tracy Lamb, 761 La Homa Drive, spoke in support of the application.

Lisa Reifers, 3475 Valle Verde Drive, spoke in opposition to the application.

Doug Hawker, 23 Summerbrooke Circle, spoke in support of the application.

Joyce Kingery, LWV of Napa County, spoke in support of the application.

Mary Steinbacker, Summerbrooke Circle, spoke in opposition of the application.

Keith Calara, Pastor, spoke in support of the application.

Francie Winnen, Resident, spoke in support of the application with modifications.

Dana Codron, Queen of the Valley Medical Center, spoke in support of the application.

Emily Wilkens, 3528 Shelter Creek, spoke in opposition of the application.

Gladys Castillo, Resident, spoke in opposition to the application.

Susan Rushinghart, Salvador Creek, spoke in opposition to the application.

Phil White, 9 Blackberry Drive, spoke in opposition to the application.

Chris Morrison, 2140 Ranch Court, spoke in opposition to the application.

Bill McGuire, 2125 Ranch Court, spoke in opposition to the application.

Randy Gularte, Resident and Business Owner, spoke in support of the application with modifications.

Alan Hagyard, 3558 Shelter Creek, spoke in opposition to the application.

Kara Harrington, 2125 Big Ranch Road, spoke in opposition to the application.

Josh Harrington, 2125 Big Ranch Road, spoke in opposition to the application.

Chuck Shinnamon, Resident, spoke in support of the application with modifications.

John Stewart, Resident, spoke in support of the application.

Christine Anderson, 3558 Shelter Creek Road, spoke in opposition to the application.

Kyle Altomare, 113 Firefly Lane, spoke in opposition to the application.

Chelsea Warner, Resident, spoke in opposition to the application.

Mark van Gorder, Napa Chamber of Commerce, spoke in support of the application.

Mary Stephenson, President of Board of Directors of Our Town St. Helena, spoke in support of the application.

Nick Hickman, Napa Little League, spoke in opposition to the application.

Chris Malan, 2945 Atlas Peak, spoke in support of the application.

Gail Gimán, Advisor to the Gasser Foundation, spoke in support of the application.

After receiving no further comments, the public hearing was closed.

Chair Painter invited the Applicant to present rebuttal to public comments.

Cass Walker provided responses to the following:

- Restoration program to stabilize the creek bank along the west side of Salvador Creek
- The Applicant's support of
  - removal of the bridge
  - compliance with flood plain regulations
- Clarification on the number of residents per unit
- Periodical meetings with residents to address concerns
- There will be set times for basketball court hours of operations

The Commission asked questions of the Applicant and Staff, and provided comments. Clarification was requested regarding:

- Hours of operation of the basketball courts
- The management plan
- How the Commission shares communications with residents with Staff
- Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA) status
- State law restrictions that limit the City's discretion to deny an affordable housing project, including supportive housing, or condition it in a manner that renders it infeasible
- County's screening process for residents
- Resident rent calculations based on income
- Enforcement of resident violations
- How issues with residents who may have a detrimental effect on the project, residents, or community would be addressed
- The number of SROs
- The restoration program alongside Salvador Creek
- Distances of the grocery stores and access to public transit

Ms. Morris responded to comments from the public and to Commissioner questions. Clarification was provided regarding:

- Emails sent to Planning Commissioners that were forwarded to Staff for public transparency
- RHNA
- Reduced parking for the SRO housing units

Mr. Florin responded to Commissioner questions:

- Management plans include a lease and 72-hour notice
- Security will be provided initially and will phase out over time. If necessary, site will have on-going security
- Communication with local residents is a priority. Concerns are expected to subside with the realization of non-issues
- Clarification regarding resident rent calculations based on income
- Not all units will be for residents of the No Place Like Home (NPLH) program
- Burbank Housing has an obligation. Residents will sign a lease that clearly states the rules that will be enforced

Ms. Rattigan provided clarification regarding the County's resident screening process.

Deputy City Attorney Sabrina Wolfson provided clarification regarding the Commission's purview regarding this application.

Commissioners discussed and began deliberation. They expressed appreciation of citizen participation and made the following final comments to forward to City Council:

- There were not any issues regarding the design of the project
- The new building complements the existing building
- The area for use by tenants is private and allows for community gatherings
- Gathering areas in the property are important for the residents
- Screening provides privacy for residents
- Success of this project will require involvement and communication with the neighborhood
- Neighborhood advisory group is important
- The City Council should be updated regularly
- Reconsider the solid wooden fence along the southern boundary
- Review options to salvage the Oak Trees along the path
- A transit plan should be explored
- Volunteer opportunities and activities should be coordinated to ensure success of the project

Commissioners Reed and Kelley moved and seconded to recommend that the City Council adopt resolutions: (i) certifying the Final Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Assessment/Finding of No Significant Impact, and (ii) approving a Use Permit for SROs on the Heritage House parcel, approving three Density Bonus Concessions, and approving Design Review Permits for Heritage House and the Valle Verde based on a determination that the application, as conditioned, is consistent with the City's General Plan, Zoning Ordinance, and other applicable City requirements and policies with the following recommended modifications:

- Increased transit services
- Permeable fence
- Regular communication with the residents
- Review of options to salvage the Oak Trees along the trail
- Programs will not expire within a year

Motion carried:

AYES: Painter, Kelley, Murray, Oñate  
NOES:  
ABSENT: Huether  
ABSTAIN:  
RECUSED:

### 8. ADMINISTRATIVE REPORTS

None.

### 9. COMMENTS BY COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF

None.

### 11. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 9:46 pm. The next regular meeting of the Planning Commission is scheduled for December 19, 2019 at 5:30 pm.

---

Beth Painter, Chair  
NAPA CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

---

Erin Morris, Secretary  
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

DRAFT