

## RESOLUTION NO. R2020-\_\_

RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF  
NAPA, STATE OF CALIFORNIA, DENYING A USE PERMIT  
AND DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT FOR THE FIRST AND  
OXBOW HOTEL AT 731 FIRST STREET

WHEREAS, on September 13, 2017, JB Leamer (the “Applicant”) submitted an application (PL16-0124) for a Use Permit pursuant to Napa Municipal Code (“NMC”) Chapter 17.60 (“Use Permit”) to authorize a 74-room hotel and a Design Review Permit pursuant to NMC Chapter 17.62 (“Design Review Permit”) to construct two four-story hotel buildings totaling 184,106 square feet in size on two lots bisected by the Wine Train railroad at the southeast corner of the intersection of First Street and Soscol Avenue and bounded by First Street, Soscol Avenue, the Napa River, the Water Street right-of-way, and the Napa River (the “Site”), APNs 003-235-003, -004, -005, -006, -007, 003-241-003, -006 (the “Project”); and

WHEREAS, the City Council of the City of Napa, State of California, held a noticed public hearing on November 17, 2020, on the subject application.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the City Council of the City of Napa as follows:

Section 1. The City Council hereby denies the Use Permit and makes the following findings in support of the denial:

- A. *The proposed use is in accord with the General Plan, applicable specific plans, the objectives of the Zoning Ordinance and the purposes of the district and overlay district in which the site is located.*

The Downtown Napa Specific Plan (DNSP) calls for buildings that reinforce the historic pattern with heights oriented to the many existing two- and three-story buildings. The proposed buildings are four stories tall. The eastern building is five stories tall as seen from the rear. This does not meet this guideline. The DNSP also has the specific objective, “Improve connectivity within Downtown and to surrounding neighborhoods.” The Project would act as a wall between the center of Downtown and the Oxbow District. This works against that objective. Another specific objective of the DNSP is to “bolster the environment as a destination for living, working, and playing.” This Project would reorient the Oxbow District from serving Napers to serving tourists. Therefore, the proposal would work against that objective.

- B. *The proposed use, together with the conditions applicable thereto, will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, or welfare, or materially injurious to properties or improvements in the vicinity, or to the general welfare of the City.*

Because the Project's use of tandem parking spaces does not allow hotel guests to retrieve their own cars, the Project would require valets to ferry cars to the First Street hotel entrances each time a guest arrived or left. Guests would not be expected to cross the street to retrieve their cars, so the cars would need to be delivered on the south, eastbound side of First Street. The valets exit each building's garage east of each building's entrance. Each of these trips would entail a trip around either the block bounded by First Street, McKinstry Street, and Soscol Avenue or the block bounded by First Street, Juarez Street, Third Street, and Soscol Avenue because U-turns are not allowed from westbound First Street at Soscol Avenue. This additional activity would be detrimental to public safety on this narrow and bustling section of First Street.

Section 2. The City Council hereby denies the Design Review Permit and makes the following findings in support of the denial:

- A. *The proposed use is in accord with the General Plan and any applicable Specific Plan design policies.*

The Project is inconsistent with the DNSP Design Guideline and Specific Objectives discussed in Section 1.A, above.

- B. *The project design is consistent with applicable Design Review guidelines adopted by the City Council.*

The Project is inconsistent with the DNSP Design Guideline discussed in Section 1.A, above.

- C. *The Design Review Permit is in accord with the applicable provisions of Title 17 of the NMC and will not be detrimental or injurious to property or improvements in the vicinity of the development site, or to the public health, safety, or general welfare.*

The Site layout concentrates the erratic traffic caused by valeting trips as discussed in Section 1.B, above. This would be detrimental to public health.

Section 3. This Resolution shall take effect immediately upon its adoption.

## ATTACHMENT 1

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing Resolution was duly adopted by the City Council of the City of Napa at a public meeting of said City Council held on the 17<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2020, by the following vote:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

ATTEST: \_\_\_\_\_  
Tiffany Carranza  
City Clerk

Approved as to form:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Michael W. Barrett  
City Attorney