



Staff Reports Details (With Text)

File #:	491-2023	Version:	1	Name:	
Type:	Evening Public Hearings	Status:		Agenda Ready	
File created:	1/9/2024	In control:	CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NAPA		
On agenda:	4/2/2024	Final action:			
Title:	First & Oxbow Hotel				
Sponsors:					
Indexes:					
Code sections:					
Attachments:	1. ATCH 1 - Resolution, 2. ATCH 1 - Resolution - EX A & B, 3. ATCH 2 - Project Description, 4. ATCH 3 - Project Plans, 5. ATCH 4 - Elevations & Renderings, 6. ATCH 5 - Design Review Updates, 7. ATCH 6 - On-Site Parking Letter, 8. ATCH 7 - Operations Memorandum, 9. ATCH 8 - Porter Vehicle, 10. ATCH 9 - Economic Impact Analysis, 11. ATCH 10 - Parking Plan, 12. ATCH 11 - Planning Commission Report (PL16-0124), 13. ATCH 12 - Council Resolution No. R2020-134, 14. ATCH 13 - 2020 Addendum, 15. ATCH 14 - Extension Approval Letter (PL22-0102), 16. ATCH 15 - Planning Commission Report with Correspondence (PL22-0137), 17. ATCH 16 - 2024 Addendum, 18. ATCH 17 - Public Comments (City Council)				

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
------	------	-----------	--------	--------

To: Honorable Mayor and Members of City Council

From: Vincent Smith, Community Development Director

Prepared By: Ryder Dilley, Associate Planner

TITLE:
First & Oxbow Hotel

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Adopt a resolution approving a Design Review Permit and Use Permit to authorize construction of a 123-room hotel consisting of two four-story buildings, which includes ancillary hotel guest and public-serving uses, and below-grade parking at 730 Water Street, and determining that the actions authorized by the resolution were adequately analyzed by a previous CEQA action.

DISCUSSION:

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Applicant, Stratus Development Partners, LLC, requests a Design Review Permit and Use Permit to authorize construction of a 123-room hotel consisting of two four-story buildings, which includes ancillary hotel guest and public serving uses, and below-grade parking (“Project”). If approved, the Project would supersede the previously approved Design Review Permit and Use Permit (“2020 Entitlements”) for the First and Oxbow Hotel (PL16-0124; City Council Resolution R2020-134, approved by City Council on November 17, 2020), for 74 rooms and ground floor retail (“2020 Project”). The Project is located at 730 Water Street.

While a more complete project description is provided below under “Project Description,” and provided in **Attachment 2, Project Description**, a summary of the proposed changes between the 2020 Project and the proposed Project is listed below, as shown in **Table 1, Summary of Changes**.

**TABLE 1
Summary of Changes**

	Approved 2020	Proposed Project	Changes
Hotel Rooms	74	123	49
Retail (square feet)	6,294	--	(6,294)
Conference (sq. ft.)	5,754	3,375	2,199)
Parking Spaces	121	154	33
Building Height (feet)	60	60	No Change
Building Size (sq. ft.)	184,106	151,224	(32,882)

II. SITE CONTEXT AND HISTORY

The Project site is approximately 0.71 acres and is composed of multiple parcels located at the southeast corner of Soscol Avenue and First Street, and First Street and the railroad. The properties are bounded by Soscol Avenue, First Street, Water Street, and the Napa River. The Project, if approved, would impact adjacent property not under the Applicant’s ownership, including City of Napa (City) rights-of-ways and Napa County Flood Control and Water Conservation District (Flood Control District) property. As part of the project, the Applicant has requested that the City abandon a portion of the Water Street right-of-way between Soscol Avenue and McKinstry Street.

The Napa Valley Wine Train railroad tracks generally divide the project site into two (2) areas. The western side of the tracks is currently vacant containing vegetation and trees, and the eastern side of the tracks are currently developed with three (3) single-story, single-family residences, a one-story commercial structure, and two (2) small accessory structures.

The overall site begins at the western boundary and entrance to the area referred to as the “Oxbow District” in the Napa 2040 General Plan. Surrounding land uses include commercial retail, and office to the north, single-family residential and commercial retail and restaurant to the east, Napa River and existing warehouse buildings containing event and transportation to the south, and Soscol Avenue, Oxbow Commons, and Napa River to the west.

A. PL16-0124 First and Oxbow Hotel

The original entitlements (PL16-0124) were approved by City Council on November 17, 2020 (City Council Resolution R2020-134) and granted a two-year extension (PL22-0102) on August 31, 2022 to November 17, 2024.

As further described in **Attachment 11, Planning Commission Report (PL16-0124)**, the 2020 Project consisted of two, four-story buildings totaling approximately 184,106 square feet accommodating 74 guest rooms (up to 37 in each building). The west building included 2,787 square

feet of commercial tenant space that could accommodate five (5) commercial tenants, along with pool and fitness facilities. The east building included 3,507 square feet of commercial tenant space for up to six (6) commercial tenants and 5,754 square feet of conference and meeting space. Both buildings included outdoor bars on their top floors.

In addition, the 2020 Project also included 121 parking spaces divided between each building's two-level subterranean garage, laundry, and housekeeping facilities in each building, along with an improved pedestrian path between First Street and Water Street parallel to the railroad. The following describes the 2020 Entitlements previously approved by Council and the entitlements requested by the new application:

- 1. Design Review Permit:** The 2020 Entitlements included a Design Review Permit for a 74-room hotel consisting of two, four-story buildings totaling 184,106 square feet on two sites divided by the Wine Train railroad at the southeast corner of the intersection of First Street and Soscol Avenue. The Design Review Permit for the 2020 Project was approved by Council Resolution No. R2020-134. The Applicant is requesting approval of a new Design Review Permit for a 123-room hotel, which, if approved, would supersede the 2020 Design Review Permit approved by Council Resolution No. R2020-134.
- 2. Use Permit:** A Use Permit is required for hotels in the OBC, Oxbow Commercial District, pursuant to the NMC Section 17.10.020. The 2020 Entitlements included a Use Permit for a 74-room hotel. The Applicant is requesting a new Use Permit for a 123-room hotel. If approved, the new Use Permit would supersede the 2020 Use Permit approved by Council Resolution No. R2020-134..
- 3. Certificate of Appropriateness:** The 2020 Entitlements included a Certificate of Appropriateness approved by Council Resolution No. R2020-135 for relocation of two Local Landmark structures from 718 Water Street and 731 First Street to 58 Randolph Street. The previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness would be extended and remain in effect.
- 4. Right-of-Way Abandonment:** In connection with the 2020 Project, the City Council approved the conditional abandonment of a portion of the Water Street right-of-way between Soscol Avenue and McKinstry Street by Council Resolution No. R2020-137. The portion of Water Street west of the Napa River is a paper street. The portion of Water Street east of the Napa River is a dead-end street. The abandonment allowed for the enlargement of the project site to allow larger buildings and for the conversion of the public street to a smaller access drive while maintaining public access. Because the conditions for the 2020 conditional abandonment were never satisfied, the abandonment of right-of-way is being proposed as part of a separate item on the same agenda. If approved, the new conditional abandonment resolution would supersede Council Resolution No. R2020-137.
- 5. Slope Easement Abandonment:** In connection with the 2020 Project, the City Council approved the conditional summary abandonment of a permanent slope easement to facilitate construction of the hotel by Council Resolution No. R2020-136. The slope easement is located adjacent to the public right-of-way of Soscol Avenue and First Street. Because the conditions for the 2020 conditional abandonment were never satisfied, the abandonment of the permanent slope easement is proposed as part of a separate item on the same agenda. If

approved, the new conditional abandonment resolution would supersede Council Resolution No. R2020-136.

6. **Quitclaim:** The City of Napa owns the parcel located at 835 First Street (APN 003-235-002) that is approximately 329 square feet in size. To facilitate development of the hotel Project, the Applicant is requesting the City quitclaim the parcel to it for the Project. This proposed action is not a part of this item and would be considered by City Council, at a future date.

7. **Lot Line Adjustment/Lot Merger:** In 2020, the prior applicant submitted an application for a lot line adjustment/merger to combine all parcels on the west side of the railroad into a single parcel and all parcels on the east side of the railroad into a single parcel. The lot line adjustment/lot merger was never approved because the abandonments of the City-owned property interests were never completed. However, in conjunction with the new entitlements, if the abandonment of the right-of-way and the permanent slope easement are approved by Council, the abandoned land area would be reconfigured to accommodate the project, and each building would be on a separate parcel separated by the railroad. The lot line adjustment/lot merger would be approved administratively should the City Council approve the project and the abandonment actions.

B. PL22-0102 First & Oxbow Extension I

City staff approved the first two-year extension administratively (PL22-0102) on August 31, 2022, which extended the 2020 Entitlements (PL16-0124) to November 17, 2024 (**Attachment 14, Extension Approval Letter (PL22-0102)**).

III. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The Applicant requests a Design Review Permit and Use Permit to authorize construction of a 123-room hotel consisting of two four-story buildings totaling approximately 151,224 square feet on lots that total approximately 0.71 acres. Of the 123 rooms, 54 rooms would be in the west building, and 69 would be in the east building.

The Project would include various amenities common to hotel use such as pool and fitness facilities in the west building facing both the Napa River and First Street frontage, respectively. The hotel would provide approximately 3,375 square feet of conference and meeting space split between the two buildings. Both buildings would also feature auxiliary bars and food service areas managed by the hotel operator, yet accessible to hotel guests and members of the public.

The hotel would provide 154 parking spaces divided between each building's single-level below-grade garage. Each building would be served by its own housekeeping facilities with further operational details described below in **Section F**. There would be an improved path between First Street and Water Street adjacent to and parallel to the railroad.

A. Amendments

As described in **Attachment 5, Design Review Updates**, the Applicant proposes a similar building footprint, setbacks, site design, height, and access as the plans for the 2020 Entitlements while partially reducing the overall massing of the west building and decreasing the below-grade parking

levels from two levels to one level. The Applicant also proposes reconfiguration of the internal space and removal of the retail space to accommodate the additional rooms.

B. Site Design

The site design for the Project is generally consistent with the 2020 Entitlements. The site is bisected by the Napa Valley Wine Train railroad tracks and fronts both First Street extending east from downtown and Soscol Avenue, with traffic heading north and south. The west building would face the Napa River towards the rear and the east building faces a dead-end street.

Both the west and north street adjacent sidewalk along Soscol Avenue and First Street feature wide sidewalks with the primary pedestrian entrances for both buildings located along First Street. The Project proposes a 13-foot-wide walkway between the east building and the railroad to provide a cut-through for people to access Water Street and connect to the future river-adjacent path and pedestrian bridge. The service entrance for the east building is accessed from Water Street, with the entrance for the west building along First Street adjacent to the railroad tracks.

C. Elevations

The Project proposes an overall height of 60 feet, similar to the 2020 Project, along with a similar style of elevation. However, the proposed Project would provide for a slightly reduced building mass by featuring an approximately 30-to-60-foot step back of the fourth floor of the western building to allow for a rooftop patio that faces up-valley to the northwest.

The facades would contain mid-elevation bay windows, and Romeo and Juliet balconies with plantings along the handrails. The corners would also feature private patios with glass door access. The siding would be composed of a variation of Woodtone lap siding with a grain finish, light beige stucco, and board-formed concrete at ground floor and garage levels. The Applicant is also proposing to swap the yellow awning as shown in the original plans for a dark-brown awning for aesthetic and long-term maintenance reasons, as shown in **Attachment 4, Elevations & Renderings**. The Project would include additional awnings above some of the east, south, and west facing windows to provide additional shading. The remaining windows along the east, south, and west-facing facades would also feature window trellises for additional variation.

Due to the reconfiguration of the ground floor levels in both the west and east building, the Applicant proposes a reduction in the amount of window glazing to provide for greater back-of-house service, equipment, and storage areas along the southeast side (rear) of both buildings; however, the rear of the west building would feature a pool area for all hotel patrons and a south-facing quasi-open atrium extending from the second to the third floor with a direct view of the Napa River.

D. Parking & Circulation

The Applicant proposes one level of below-grade parking with 154 parking spaces. The Project would utilize mechanical parking stackers as further described in **Attachment 6, On-Site Parking Letter**, to fit vehicles more efficiently while reducing the amount of soil needing to be excavated from the site. The parking facilities would not be accessible by members of the public or hotel patrons; instead, the facilities would only be accessible by the hotel operator and appropriately trained hotel staff members.

NMC Section 17.54.040, defers to Chapter 6 of the Downtown Napa Specific Plan (“DNSP”) to regulate parking for properties located within the DNSP boundaries. The DNSP specifies the following parking ratio for hotel uses: 1 space per sleeping room plus 1 space for the manager and 1 space for every 2 employees (full or part time), plus if the hotel has convention, banquet, restaurant or meeting facilities, parking shall be provided in addition to the hotel requirement, as determined by the decision-making body. Staff recommends that the City Council apply the general parking requirement for commercial space in the DNSP of 3.2 spaces per 1,000 square feet to this small meeting space. **Table 2**, below, illustrates the total required parking.

TABLE 2
Required vs. Provided Parking

DNSP Parking Requirements	Parking Required
1 space per sleeping room	123 spaces
1 space for manager	1 space
1 space for every 2 employees (32 employees)	16 spaces
3,375 sq. ft. commercial space @ 3.2 per 1,000 sq. ft.	10.8 spaces
Total Required	151 spaces
Total Provided	154 spaces

Vehicular access to the western building and eastern building parking garages would be accessed via a ramp leading from First Street, just west of the railroad tracks, and via a ramp leading down from Water Street on the south side of the building, respectively.

E. Landscaping

The site landscaping for the proposed Project is the same as the 2020 Project approval. The site would feature street trees and low hedges defining the semi-public street-side space. Both buildings would be constructed with centered atriums and trees in the middle starting on the second floor. The balconies and private patio spaces would also feature additional plantings along the handrails to help soften the façade.

The Project would require the Applicant to remove one (1) Coast Live Oak that is classified as a Protected Native Tree pursuant to NMC Chapter 12.45. The removal of the protected native tree may be authorized by the City Council pursuant to NMC Section 12.45.090; however, the Applicant would be required to satisfy the replacement criteria as described in NMC Section 12.45.100.

F. Operations

The hotel buildings would be located on separate parcels bisected by railroad tracks, but function as one hotel. Operations such as valet, deliveries, laundry services, luggage, food services, trash collection, and transportation would be shared between the buildings. As further described in **Attachment 7, Operations Memorandum**, functions such as deliveries, laundry, and trash collection would require the use of a street legal porter vehicle (see **Attachment 8, Porter Vehicle**) transporting goods or refuse along the public streets from building to building. Food service is not contemplated to travel between buildings; however, luggage may be transported from the east building to the west building via a non-motorized luggage cart along the sidewalk and across the

railroad tracks.

All valet drop-off and pick up would occur at the east building in a designated unloading and loading area. To prevent excessive queuing along First Street, guests would pick up their vehicles staged at the garage opening on Water Street for the east building.

G. Public Art

The Applicant has expressed interest in installing a public art feature, but an artist or design concept has not yet been identified at this stage. However, the Applicant has indicated that it no longer intends to pursue construction and placement of the “arrow” art contemplated in the 2020 Project approval.

Pursuant to NMC Section 15.108.040, the Applicant would be required to have (1) an on-site public art feature approved by Council, (2) request City Council consider placement of a developer-funded piece in a public place nearby - which is identified in the public art master plan, (3) pay the public art contribution, or (4) install public art on the development project site that has a value lower than the public art contribution amount and make an in-lieu contribution for the balance of the public art contribution. The Applicant shall demonstrate compliance with NMC Chapter 15.108 prior to obtaining a building permit for construction of the development project.

H. Affordable Housing Impact Fee

As further described in Exhibit C of **Attachment 12, Council Resolution No. R2020-134**, the 2020 Entitlements included approval of an alternative equivalent proposal pursuant to NMC Section 15.94.070. The approved alternative equivalent consisted of recordation of a deed restriction on a separate residential site requiring that not less than three (3) units be affordable to low-income households (80% or less of AMI). However, because building permits were never issued for the 2020 Project, the deed restriction was never recorded.

Pursuant to NMC Chapter 15.94, the Applicant is now electing to pay the affordable housing impact fee to satisfy the code requirements rather than pursue an alternative equivalent. The affordable housing impact fees shall be paid prior to the issuance of a building permit. The estimate for the fees at the current hotel rate of \$6.00 per square foot would be approximately \$907,344.00; however, the Applicant will be required to pay the rate in effect at the time of permit issuance.

The purpose of NMC Chapter 15.94 is to promote the achievement of policy goals identified in the Housing Element of the City's General Plan, and to mitigate the impacts that development projects have on the need for affordable housing, by imposing an affordable housing impact fee on every development project. City policies encourage programs to bridge the affordability gap between market rate and affordable units for lower wage earners. Affordable housing impact fees shall be calculated by the Chief Building Official based on the methodology identified by the City Council and in the amounts established by implementing resolution for each development project land use category.

IV. ANALYSIS

A. General Plan

The property is located within the Oxbow Commercial General Plan Designation of the Napa 2040 General Plan. The Oxbow Commercial land use designation and zoning district applies to the eastern portion of Downtown generally between Soscol Avenue and the Napa River and north to River Terrace Drive. The Oxbow Commercial land use designation and zoning district allows for uses oriented to tourists such as hotels and their related amenities; recreational facilities; community and visitor-serving retail, commercial, entertainment and restaurants; and similar compatible uses in addition to residential and live/work opportunities. The Project would provide for a use oriented towards tourists and would be compatible with and support adjacent community and visitor-serving retail, commercial, entertainment and restaurant businesses in the Oxbow District and greater downtown area. The Project would be consistent with the following goals outlined in the Napa 2040 General Plan:

- **Policy LUCD 13-1** Promote infill development in Focus Areas that makes efficient use of limited land supply, while ensuring compatibility and integration with adjacent uses. Ensure that uses and intensities of infill development support a cohesive development pattern.
- **Policy LUCD 18-6** Continue development of the pedestrian/bike trail network, including access to the Vine Trail along the Napa River; require new development to connect to trails when consistent with the City of Napa Bicycle Plan.
- **Policy ED 6-1** Continue to support tourism and the development of visitor-serving components to the City’s economy as a valuable source of jobs, tax revenues, and cultural amenities.

B. Downtown Napa Specific Plan & Zoning

The property is located within the boundaries of the Downtown Napa Specific Plan (DNSP) area and identified as OBC, Oxbow Commercial Zoning District. The OBC district applies to the eastern portion of Downtown generally between Soscol Avenue and the Napa River and north to River Terrace Drive. The District allows for tourist-oriented uses such as hotels and their related amenities, recreational facilities, community and visitor-serving retail, commercial, restaurants, and similar compatible uses.

The site is also subject to the DNSP Building Form Overlay (“BF Overlay”); “Downtown II”. Regulations established by the BF Overlay District are technically in addition to regulations of the underlying zone district with which it is combined. However, the OBC simply defers to the BF Overlay standards and does not prescribe any additional standards. As such, the following **Table 3, Downtown II Development Standards**, summarizes the project’s consistency with the subject development standards:

**TABLE 3
Downtown II Development Standards**

Development Standards	OBC District	Project Proposed
Floor Area Ratio (FAR)	4.0	3.9
Building Height (feet)	max. 60’	60’
Front Setback (feet)	max. 15’	10.8’
Side Setback (feet)	n/a	West: 15.9’ East: 10’

Rear Setback (feet)	n/a	20'
---------------------	-----	-----

The Downtown II regulations establish a building form allowing for medium-to-high density development designed to be complimentary to the downtown core. While the massing and footprint of the proposed structure is consistent with the design of the 2020 Project, neither the 2020 building nor the proposed building feature a traditional setback, as required by the DNSP, for the third story and above along the east side of the eastern building since that side of the building is facing an existing residential structure; however, the regulations do allow for the building to be constructed at the property line.

As proposed, the footprint of the building is approximately 10 feet from the property line. With the partial wall plane projection, the third and fourth story would still be a greater distance from the property line than the DNSP requires.

The Project site is also located within the FP, Floodplain Management, SC, Soscol Corridor, and TI, Traffic Impact Zone Overlays, which require compliance with NMC Chapters 17.38, 17.46, and 17.48, respectively. The Project has been reviewed by the Public Works Department to ensure compliance with floodplain management and traffic-related regulations to ensure the Project is built in a safe manner. While the Project site is located within the boundaries of the Soscol Corridor/Downtown Riverfront Development and Design Guidelines, the design regulations in the DNSP supersede the alternate regulations.

C. Design Review Permit

Pursuant to NMC Section 17.62.050, an application for a Design Review Permit is required for all hotels. To approve a Design Review Permit, the City Council is required to make the findings prescribed in NMC Section 17.62.080. Those findings are shown below under the “Findings” section, along with Staff’s analysis of each finding.

D. Use Permit

Pursuant to NMC Section 17.10.020, the OBC Zone District allows for a hotel subject to the approval of a Use Permit. Use Permits are required for land uses that may be suitable only in specific locations or require special consideration in their design, operation, or layout to ensure compatibility with surrounding uses. To approve a Use Permit, the City Council is required to make the findings prescribed in NMC Section 17.60.070. Those findings are shown below under the “Findings” section, along with Staff’s analysis of each finding.

E. Hotel Policies

The following is a discussion of how the project complies with the City’s Hotel Policies adopted in 2008.

- 1. A priority should be placed on the development of full-service and resort hotels downtown because of the ancillary and complementary benefits to other downtown uses and activities. This does not preclude the full range of additional lodging products in appropriate locations throughout the city.**

The Project would house a full-service hotel including meeting rooms, and auxiliary bars and food

service areas managed by the hotel operator, yet accessible to hotel guests and members of the public, that are part of a full-service hotel's slate of services. It would be located within walking distance of the City's top tourist attractions, including the fairgrounds that host the Bottle Rock Music Festival and its approximately 120,000 attendees.

- 2. Limited service hotels with meeting room space and close proximity to surrounding support services would be considered desirable. Bed and breakfasts and small inns as in-fill projects would be encouraged as indicated in the General Plan.**

This policy is not applicable.

- 3. New hotel projects should provide a minimum of 15-100 square feet of contiguous meeting room space per guest room depending on the type of hotel and location to facilitate and expand the group meeting demand.**

The 123-room hotel would include 3,375 square feet of indoor conference space. This equates to approximately 27.43 square feet of conference space per guest room.

- 4. Hotel applicants/developers should demonstrate how they will pursue mass transport activities that reduce traffic congestion such as shuttle services, linkages with other hotels, use of the trolley or like public transit options, for guest and employees, particularly for group-oriented hotels.**

Guests of the resort would use personal vehicles that would be valet parked upon arrival. Although guests are not forbidden from using their vehicles, the hotel is within walking distance of the City's main tourist attractions and the locations of its most popular events, including the Napa Valley Wine Train depot, Oxbow Public Market, CIA at Copia, and the fairgrounds that host the Bottle Rock Music Festival. The hotel will also be close to public transit. The Applicant is not a hotel operator, so operations like arranging group tours would be up to the hotel operator once one is selected.

- 5. Hotel applicants/developers should demonstrate how they will link with the Napa Valley College Hospitality Institute and Hospitality and Tourism Management Program, and/or provide in-house hospitality and employment training programs that will provide a career ladder and stable employment sector.**

The Applicant's economic impact statement includes a list of workers that would be needed to operate a hotel complex of the proposed size and the estimated wages that they will be paid. These positions range from \$17/hr to \$120,000/yr. It will be up to the hotel operator to decide whether to train people on the job and promote employees to more responsible positions, creating a career ladder within the company, or to hire high-wage employees from outside.

- 6. Hotel projects should demonstrate how they will meet sustainability (green) practices as determined by LEED standards or future green ordinances or initiatives that may be adopted by the City.**

The Project would meet or exceed California's stringent building code. The site is located in a walkable area in downtown Napa and is near tourist attractions. It will meet all standards for storm water management, low-flow plumbing fixtures, efficient lighting, and high efficiency mechanical

systems.

7. Hotel applications should demonstrate as part of the application process a commitment to advancing cultural arts by providing a public art component visible and accessible to the public, particularly for hotels located downtown. Hotel projects in the pipeline may be subject to a future "art in public places" ordinance, pending adoption by City Council in 2008.

The Applicant has communicated interest in installing a public art feature, but it has not yet been identified at this stage; however, the Applicant has identified that it would no longer pursue construction and placement of the "arrow" art contemplated in the 2020 Project approval. Refer to Section IV.I. above.

8. Hotel applicants should provide a report or study that provides a comprehensive overview regarding hotel employment. The report or study should be prepared by an independent consultant and include, at a minimum, the following information: the number of employees the hotel would employ, full-time vs. part-time, position titles, wage rates by position, and types of benefits; the anticipated breakdown of employees residing inside or outside the County of Napa, and the rationale for breakdown; and any programs or policies the Applicant or operator will implement in the area of employee housing and congestion management. The City Council has requested this employment information to measure any economic, housing and transportation impacts the hotel would create.

*The Applicant submitted **Attachment 9, Economic Impact Analysis**, and the following data below:*

Annual Economic Impact at Hotel Oxbow Stabilization

- 12% TOT = \$1,831,716
- 2% Tourism = \$305,286
- 1% Affordable Housing = \$152,643

Hotel Oxbow Team Members

- Executive & Management - Base annual salary range of \$48,000 to \$120,000
- Sales & Marketing - Salary range of \$52,000 to \$82,000
- Engineers - Salary range of \$25 to \$33 per hour
- Front Desk Attendants - Salary range of \$17 to \$21 per hour
- House Keeping & Laundry Staff - Salary range of \$17 to \$21 per hour
- Tipped valet & Bell Staff - Salary range of \$17 to \$21 per hour

Hotel Oxbow Restaurant and Bar Team Members

- Management - Salary range of \$48,000 to \$95,000
- Cooks and Prep Staff - Salary range of \$17 to \$28 per hour
- Tipped Staff - Salary range of \$17 to 21 per hour

Misc.

- *Estimated construction income to local North Bay and Bay Area contractors - \$40,500,000*
- *Project construction will generate approximately 275 individual local area jobs and tax revenue during the 22-months of construction activity.*
- *Project operations after opening will generate approximately 32 full-time local individual jobs with a 1.10 multiplier for supporting services.*

V. PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING

On February 1, 2024, the Planning Commission held a public hearing to consider this application. The Commission was generally inquisitive relative to the timing for consideration of the proposed Project and an amendment to the Downtown Napa Specific Plan, and whether the Project is a new entitlement or whether the Commission would be considering an amendment to the approved Project (PL16-0124). Some of the Commissioners also sought clarification on the Applicant's responsibility for payment of the Affordable Housing Impact Fee, the connection between the Project and a supportive housing project located at 515 Silverado Trail, the projected employment, the parking requirements, the green-building measures, and the flood improvements. Staff and Applicant team, collectively responded to the Commissioners' questions.

During public comment, eight (8) members of the public spoke voicing concerns about the Project and four (4) members spoke in support of the Project. Concerns ranged from traffic and parking issues, project modifications increasing the number of rooms, need for an amendment to the Downtown Napa Specific Plan, flood improvements, and climate concerns. The members of the public who voiced support of the Applicant spoke to the relationship between the Applicant and Jamboree Housing Corporation, as well as general support of the proposed modifications to the project. Staff and Applicant team, collectively responded to the Commissioners' questions.

The Commission began deliberation, and discussion ensued. The comments generally consisted of the following:

- General concerns about the potential of losing the Jamboree Housing project located at 515 Silverado Trail, although the projects are not contractually connected.
- Concerns that the Project may not have been adequately analyzed and separate acknowledgement that the Project has been adequately analyzed under CEQA.
- Sentiment that the Project is not a dramatic change from the project previously considered.
- Vacant land is not the highest and best use of the land, nor is it the best use for the City.
- Acknowledgement of the concerns raised by members of the public, however, there may be issues beyond the Applicant.
- Hopes that this Project is the catalyst for updating the downtown-specific plan.

At the conclusion of the hearing, the Planning Commission recommended approval of the project by a vote of 3-1, with one recusal.

The Planning Commission meeting minutes excerpt is attached to the Commission staff report, **Attachment 15**.

VI. PUBLIC COMMENTS

As of this writing, seven (7) public comments have been received for the Council meeting, including two (2) of which were received during the Planning Commission hearing. The public comments are included as **Attachment 17, Public Comments (City Council)**. There were also fifteen (15) public comments received and one (1) response letter prepared by David J. Powers & Associates, Inc., the City's environmental consultant, prior to the Planning Commission meeting. The comments are included as **Attachment 15, Planning Commission Report**.

FINANCIAL IMPACTS:

No direct fiscal impact to the General Fund have been identified with this application.

CEQA:

City Staff recommends that the City Council determine that the Project falls within the scope of the Downtown Napa Specific Plan Program (DNSP) Final Environmental Impact Report (DNSP FEIR) certified by the City Council on May 1, 2012 (SCH #2010042043), as documented in the 2020 Addendum prepared for the 2020 Project and the January 2024 Addendum prepared for the new Project and on file with the City Clerk, and no further environmental review is required under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Sections 15162, 15164 and 15168 as documented in the 2024 Addendum prepared for the project included as **Attachment 16**.

DOCUMENTS ATTACHED:

ATCH 1 - Resolution
ATCH 1 - Resolution - EX A & B
ATCH 2 - Project Description
ATCH 3 - Project Plans
ATCH 4 - Elevations & Renderings
ATCH 5 - Design Review Updates
ATCH 6 - On-Site Parking Letter
ATCH 7 - Operations Memorandum
ATCH 8 - Porter Vehicle
ATCH 9 - Economic Impact Analysis
ATCH 10 - Parking Plan
ATCH 11 - Planning Commission Report (PL16-0124)
ATCH 12 - Council Resolution No. R2020-134
ATCH 13 - 2020 Addendum
ATCH 14 - Extension Approval Letter (PL22-0102)
ATCH 15 - Planning Commission Report with Correspondence (PL22-0137)
ATCH 16 - 2024 Addendum
ATCH 17 - Public Comments (City Council)

NOTIFICATION:

Notice that this application was received was provided by the City on March 2, 2023, and notice of the scheduled public hearing was provided on March 22, 2024, by US Postal Service to all property

owners within a 500-foot radius of the subject property. Notice of the public hearing was also published in the Napa Valley Register on March 23, 2024, and provided to people previously requesting notice on the matter at the same time notice was provided to the newspaper for publication.