



## Staff Reports Details (With Text)

**File #:** 318-2020      **Version:** 1  
**Type:** Evening Public Hearings      **Status:** Agenda Ready  
**File created:** 9/14/2020      **In control:** CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NAPA  
**On agenda:** 10/20/2020      **Final action:**  
**Title:** Braydon Apartments, Phase II

**Sponsors:**

**Indexes:**

**Code sections:**

**Attachments:** 1. ATCH 1 - Resolution, 2. EX A - Napa Sanitation letter dated June 08, 2020, 3. EX B - Environmental Health Memorandum dated February 13, 2020, 4. EX C - Flood District Letter dated February 13, 2020, 5. ATCH 2 - PC Staff Report, corres & mins excerpts, 6. ATCH 3 - Project Description and Plans, 7. ATCH 4 - Applicant's Letter to Council

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
------	------	-----------	--------	--------

10/20/2020	1	CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NAPA		
------------	---	----------------------------------	--	--

**To:** Honorable Mayor and Members of City Council

**From:** Vincent Smith, Community Development Director

**Prepared By:** Michael Allen, Senior Planner

### TITLE:

Braydon Apartments, Phase II

### RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Adopt a resolution approving a Design Review Permit for Phase II of the Braydon Apartments (formerly the Vista Tulocay Apartments) and determining that the potential environmental effects of the actions authorized by this resolution were adequately analyzed by a previous CEQA action.

### DISCUSSION:

#### PROJECT DESCRIPTION AND BACKGROUND

The Applicant, Fairfield Napa Phase II, LLC is requesting approval of a Design Review Permit for the construction of a 218 unit apartment project on an 8.3-acre property in the Gasser Master Plan area. The complex is comprised of two 4-story buildings and three 3-story buildings. The units are all stacked flats and include 116 one-bedroom units, 86 two-bedroom units, and 16 three-bedroom units which range in size from 675 square feet to 1,431 square feet. The complex will include several open space areas including a pool/spa, clubhouse, fitness center, and dog park. Parking will be provided in attached garages, carports, and uncovered spaces.

#### PROJECT HISTORY AND CONTEXT

The original application for the Vista Tulocay Apartments (PL13-0139) included two phases: Phase I (282 units) which has recently completed construction, and Phase II (218 units) which is the subject of this review. The Planning Commission conducted a preliminary review of the original project in May 2014 and was generally supportive. However only Phase I went forward for Final Design Review. The Applicant subsequently amended the project to include only Phase I of the project which was approved by the City Council in August 2016.

Concurrent with approval of Phase I, the Council adopted a Development Agreement which provided the Applicant with vested rights to construct 500 residential units, including the 282 units in the approved Phase I project and the 218 units which are the subject of this Design Review application as Phase II. ( In addition, as discussed in more detail below, the City Council approved an affordable housing alternative equivalent for the project (Phase I and II,) which required the Applicant to pay \$2,000,000 in affordable housing impact fees to the City also provides the City with accelerated and specific housing fees for the entire 500 units.

It is also noted that in December 2018 the Applicant had submitted a completely different application for the Phase II property that was comprised of a total of 102 units (40 single family dwellings and 62 townhomes). Staff expressed concerns to the Applicant that this lower density “for-sale” product was inconsistent with the City’s housing development objectives and encouraged the Applicant to reconsider the project’s unit type and to increase the density. The Applicant subsequently withdrew that application before there was any review by the Planning Commission or City Council and submitted a new application for the 218 unit residential project that is now before the Council.

The 8.27-acre project site is generally flat, treeless and unimproved. The site is bordered by the Wine Train and the Napa River to the west, the Napa Flood District basin to the east, undeveloped lands designated for commercial use to the south across Tulocay Creek, and the Braydon Phase I apartment project to the north. The Braydon Phase I apartment project consists of a total of 282 units and was recently completed and now partially occupied. The project is accessed from Peatman Drive via Vista Tulocay Lane which extends through the Braydon Phase I apartments and will serve the Phase II project.

## ANALYSIS

### GENERAL PLAN

The property has a General Plan designation of MU, Mixed Use (MU-532), which provides for a functionally integrated mix of retail commercial, office, possible light manufacturing, and higher density residential uses that are typically attached. Residential densities shall range from 20 to 40 units per acre while densities up to 45 units per acre may be allowed on a case-by-case basis at the discretion of the City, provided the development provides a high-quality design that fits with and enhances the site context, and helps create a vibrant transit-and river-oriented residential mixed use district.

The 20 - 40 units an acre density range would allow between 165 to 330 units on this 8.27 acre site. The proposed 218 units provides 26 units per acre, which is consistent with the density range of MU-532 designation, but more so with the density range of the Tulocay Village District of the Gasser Master Plan. The Gasser Master Plan specifies a minimum of 380 units and a maximum of 500 units for the Tulocay Village District. The proposed 218 units combined with the approved 282 units from the Phase I project accomplishes the maximum of 500 units. Higher density residential uses (over 15

du/acre) are generally located nearest to thoroughfares, transit corridors and community-serving commercial and public/quasi-public uses. Higher density residential should be promoted and encouraged adjacent to employment and neighborhood-serving commercial uses to ensure the efficient use of land, public facilities and services.

Staff has also reviewed the project for consistency with all other applicable General Plan policies. In particular, the project complies with policies of the Land Use Element and Housing Element identified below.

### Land Use Element

One of the fundamental goals of the Land Use Element is, “[to] preserve and enhance the residential character of existing neighborhoods and provide for new residential development consistent with the city’s character and urban form.” To help achieve this goal, the Land Use Element includes a series of policies, two of which are listed below:

*LU-3.1 The City shall provide for the efficient development and redevelopment of land within the RUL in order to allow job and housing growth through the end of the planning period.*

The proposed 218 unit residential development provides an efficient housing development that will provide market-rate housing on an underutilized parcel of land.

*LU-4.2 The City shall require new residential development to conform to the density range shown in Table 1-4 (unless site-specific physical or environmental constraints preclude the achievement of the minimum density; unless density bonuses are granted; or unless, in Multi-Family Residential areas, housing policy H-1.7 permits density flexibility within the Multi Family range), and to be consistent with the general neighborhood typology of the surrounding area. The City may require clustering in environmentally sensitive areas when special measures are adopted to ensure the sensitive portions of each property remain undeveloped in the future.*

The proposed 218 unit residential development has a project density of 26.36 units per acre which is consistent with the density range.

### Housing Element

One of the fundamental goals of the Housing Element is to ensure the development of “a variety of housing types and choices.” To help achieve this goal, the Housing Element includes a series of policies, eight of which are listed below:

*H-1.1 Efficient Use of Land. The City shall promote creative and efficient use of vacant and built on land within its RUL to help maintain the City’s pre-eminent agricultural environment and open space.*

The proposed 218 unit residential development provides an efficient housing development that will provide market-rate housing on an underutilized parcel of land long planned for housing.

*H1.2 Provide Adequate Sites. The City shall maintain an adequate supply of land designated for all types of residential development to meet the quantified housing need of 835 City units and up to 57 County units for the state-mandated time frame of the Housing Element (2015 to January 2023). Within this total, the City shall maintain a sufficient supply of land zoned for multi-family housing to*

*meet the quantitative housing need of 317 lower income and 151 moderate income housing units.*

The proposed 218 unit residential development is consistent with the above policy in that it provides housing units that will help meet the quantified housing needs for the City for market rate housing units.

*H1.4 Efficient Use of Sites. The City shall make every effort to approve well-designed projects at the mid to high range of General Plan densities.*

The proposed 218 unit residential development is consistent with the residential design guidelines and provides a well-designed housing development that is in the mid-range of the General Plan density.

*H-2.2 Mix of Housing. The City shall encourage an increased mix of various types of housing throughout the City to meet community housing needs, provide greater housing choices, and improve transportation choices. In addition to single family homes, housing choices and the mix of housing in the community should include such types as multi-family, mixed use, affordable units, supportive housing, Single Room Occupancies (SRO), co-housing and similar types of housing that meet a wide variety of community housing needs.*

The proposed 218 multi-family development will provide a housing type that is currently in demand to satisfy the community housing needs.

*H-3.1 High Quality Design and Varied Housing Types. The City shall assure high quality, well-designed housing that respects the surrounding neighborhood, and provide for a greater variety of housing options to meet community needs.*

The Housing Element also has policies to encourage the efficient use of land and that make every effort to approve well-designed projects consistent with General Plan densities. This project appears consistent with both of these policy goals, as the proposed development of 218 apartment units on the 8.27 acre site is consistent with the General Plan density range. In addition, the City has adopted Residential Design Guidelines to ensure that new infill developments are compatible with existing neighborhoods.

Therefore, both the proposed land uses and the proposed density are consistent with the requirements of the General Plan's MU designation.

## ZONING

The project site is located with the Tulocay Village District of the Gasser Master Plan. The intent of the Tulocay Village District is to provide a variety of housing types and densities. When the Gasser Master Plan was adopted the Tulocay Village District was approved for between 380 to 500 residential units depending on the size of the development site. As residential density within the district is to vary, the minimum density is averaged over the entirety of the zoning district. The 218 units are Phase II of the development with Phase I being the 282 previously approved Vista Tulocay units (now called Braydon Phase I). Based on the approved density range of the Gasser Master Plan, Phase II must be developed with between 98 to 218 residential units. For additional development standards discussion and a detailed list of the apartment complexes development criteria, see Section IV.B. of the Planning Commission staff report (ATTACHMENT 2).

## DESIGN REVIEW

NMC Sections 17.08.060 and 17.62.050 require a Design Review Permit for new residential structures. Consistent with this requirement, the Applicant has submitted architectural plans for the development. In addition, Staff reviewed the principles in the adopted Gasser Master Plan Design Guidelines for reviewing the site development and architectural design. The proposed development includes a total of five residential buildings with three different building configurations. The total number of units within each building will vary from 20 to 76 units. The new buildings will be three- and four-story walk-ups with tuck-under one car garages. See Planning Commission staff report (Attachment 2) for a detailed Design Review analysis.

## AFFORDABLE HOUSING OVERLAY

A portion of the project site is located within the :AH, Affordable Housing Overlay District. The :AH Overlay in a multi-family designation typically requires 10% of the units be constructed onsite for very low income households and that 10% of the units be constructed on site for low income households, unless the development receives approval for an “alternative equivalent” proposal pursuant to NMC Section 15.94.050(B). The very low-income requirement for the Phase I and Phase II projects was satisfied through the construction and operation of the 59-bed homeless shelter and health clinic, and 24 units of transitional housing, which the City Council approved as an alternative equivalent in 2006 for the Gasser Master Plan Area. In 2016, the City Council approved an alternative equivalent proposal to satisfy the low income requirement for Phase I and Phase II which consisted of payment to the City of \$2,000,000 in affordable housing impact fees. The Applicant paid the entire fee into the City’s Affordable Housing Impact Fee Fund in 2017. The City used \$1.5 M of the \$2M to provide assistance to Burbank Housing to fund the construction of Stoddard West, a 50-unit low income rental project located in the Gasser Master Plan Area. Therefore, both the very low income and low income affordable housing requirements for this Phase II project have already been satisfied.

## PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING

The Planning Commission held a preliminary review of the Project on April 2, 2020 and a subsequent public hearing on September 3, 2020. The Commission heard a report from Staff, followed by a presentation by the Applicant team. No one from the public spoke during public comment. The Commission reviewed the modifications made to the Project based on their direction from their preliminary review. These modifications included a less “bland” revised color palate, shading study for the pool area, better detailed pedestrian circulation/trail exhibit and public art. For more details about the modifications elicited from the Planning Commission’s preliminary review see the Planning Commission staff report (Attachment 2).

The Commission expressed their appreciation for the Applicant’s willingness to respond to the design changes requested at the preliminary review. They inquired if a connection from the Project site to the Vine Trail was planned as part of this project. Staff shared that the project has been designed to integrate with a future Vine Trail connection, and the Tulocay Creek Trail connection is required to be constructed by the Gasser Foundation, but actual connection across the Wine Train tracks will be a future City sponsored project. The Commission accepted the Applicant’s commitment to provide an art mural on portions of the building, although public art is not required of residential projects.

At the conclusion of the hearing, the Planning Commission recommend approval of the project by a

vote of 5-0.

**FINANCIAL IMPACTS:**

No direct financial impacts to the General Fund have been identified with this application.

**CEQA:**

City staff recommends that the City Council determine that the potential environmental effects of the Recommended Action were adequately analyzed and addressed by the Final Environmental Impact Report certified in conjunction with the adoption of the Gasser Master Plan on November 21, 2006 and by the Vista Tulocay Apartments Project Addendum to the Final Environmental Impact Report for the Gasser Master Plan, adopted on August 16, 2016. The Braydon Apartments (Phase II) was considered along with the Vista Tulocay Apartments (Phase I) in the Vista Tulocay Apartments Project Addendum. None of the conditions described under CEQA Guidelines Section 15162 requiring the preparation of a subsequent EIR are present. As such, no further environmental review is required for this Project.

**DOCUMENTS ATTACHED:**

ATCH 1 - Draft Resolution approving a Design Review Permit  
EX A - Napa Sanitation letter dated June 08, 2020  
EX B - Environmental Health Memorandum dated February 13, 2020  
EX C - Flood District Letter dated February 13, 2020  
ATCH 2 - Planning Commission Staff Report (attachments removed to avoid duplication),  
correspondence and minutes excerpts  
ATCH 3 - Project Description and Plans  
ATCH 4 - Applicant's Letter to Council

**NOTIFICATION:**

Notice of the scheduled public hearing was provided on October 8, 2020 by US Postal Service to all property owners within a 500-foot radius of the subject property. Notice of the public hearing was also published in the Napa Valley Register on October 9, 2020 and provided to people previously requesting notice on the matter at the same time notice was provided to the newspaper for publication. The Applicant was also provided a copy of this report and the associated attachments in advance of the public hearing on the project.