



**Community Development Department – Planning Division  
1600 First Street + P.O. Box 660  
Napa, CA 94559-0660**

**(707) 257-9530**

---

**CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION  
ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT  
NOVEMBER 1, 2012**

**AGENDA ITEM 6.A: HISTORIC RESOURCES INVENTORY UPDATE – ADDITIONAL  
6Z PROPERTIES REMOVAL**

**I. GENERAL INFORMATION**

**PROJECT SUMMARY:** Update of Historic Resources Inventory to remove three 6Z-designated properties.

**LOCATION OF PROPERTIES:** 1514 Clay Street  
1512 Fourth Street (also known as 701-705 School Street)  
801-809 Coombs Street

**APPLICANT:** City of Napa Phone: (707) 257-9530  
1600 First Street  
Napa, CA 94559

**PROPERTY OWNERS:** Daniel Skivington  
1039 Stonebridge Avenue  
Napa, CA 94558  
  
Nestor Macaraig  
3557 Silver Springs Road  
Lafayette, CA 94549  
  
Robert Decampo  
Dickenson, Peatman and Fogarty  
1455 First Street, Suite 301  
Napa, CA 94559

**STAFF PLANNER:** Kevin Eberle, Senior Planner Phone: (707) 257-9357

## **II. BACKGROUND AND DISCUSSION**

Section 15.52.030.E.3 of the Napa Municipal Code sets forth the duties of the Cultural Heritage Commission to include the periodic update the City's Historic Resources Inventory. In 2008, the City initiated "Heritage Napa", a historic resources survey and preservation program. Heritage Napa includes the preparation of new historic surveys for the purpose of updating the Historic Resources Inventory. To date, historic context statements/surveys have been completed for the areas of Soscol Gateway/East Napa, Spencer's Addition, West Napa, Downtown, and Alta Heights.

In December 2011 and January 2012, the Commission removed a total of 407 properties from the Inventory based upon the properties being assigned a State status code of 6Z in these new surveys. A 6Z rating is defined as "found ineligible for National Register, California Register, or local designation through survey evaluation." Based upon further recent review of these surveys, staff discovered that there were three additional properties in the Downtown survey area which were assigned a State status code of 6Z, but which were inadvertently left off the list of properties to be removed from the Inventory. These properties are 1514 Clay Street, 1512 Fourth Street (also known as 701-705 School Street), and 801-809 Coombs Street.

The Downtown survey prepared by Page and Turnbull consultants included documentation of certain properties on standardized State Department of Parks and Recreation forms known as "523-B" forms. The documentation includes a brief history of the property, an evaluation of historic significance using standardized criterion, a discussion of building integrity, and a brief conclusion section which assigns a State status Code. The three subject properties were included among 57 properties that were so documented (see forms in Attachment 1). In the case of these three properties, the the consultant assigned each a State status code of 6Z (ineligible for federal, State or local listing). Although the Downtown survey included a Table 10 entitled "Former HRI Properties that Appear Ineligible for Listing", the consultant left the subject three properties off this list. As such, they were overlooked by staff when previous recommendations were made to the Commission for removal of properties from the Inventory. The purpose of the recommended action is to correct this error. The three property owners have been informed about the recommended action.

## **III. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

The removal of these three properties from the Historic Resources Inventory is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15305 of the CEQA Guidelines which exempts minor alterations in land use limitations.

#### **IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Cultural Heritage Commission approve the removal of the three properties from the Historic Resources Inventory as recommended in the Downtown survey.

#### **V. REQUIRED ACTIONS**

Final action by the Cultural Heritage Commission:

1. Determine that this project is exempt from the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15305 (Categorical Exemptions; Class 5) of the CEQA Guidelines, which exempts minor alterations to existing land use limitations.
2. Adopt the attached resolution removing the three 6Z-designated properties from the Historic Resources Inventory.

#### **DOCUMENTS ATTACHED**

1. 523-B Forms
2. Draft Resolution

Prepared by:

Kevin Eberle  
Senior Planner

c: Property Owners

# CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

---



November 1, 2012

1. **ROLL CALL:** Heather McCollister, Cindy Watter, Craig Songer, Sarah Van Giesen, Bob Nicol  
**ABSENT:** None  
**STAFF:** Rick Tooker, Kevin Eberle, Carolyn Van Dyke

2. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

3. **AGENDA REVIEW:**

The Agenda was unanimously approved as submitted.

4. **PUBLIC COMMENT:**

None.

5. **CONSENT CALENDAR:**

**A. APPROVAL OF CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION MINUTES:**

Consideration of Cultural Heritage Commission Meeting Minutes for [September 6, 2012](#).

Commissioners Watter/Songer moved and seconded to approve the September 6, 2012 meeting minutes as submitted. Motion carried 5-0.

6. **CONSENT HEARINGS:**

**A. HISTORIC RESOURCES INVENTORY UPDATE – [6Z PROPERTIES REMOVAL](#)**  
(City of Napa)

Request to update the City of Napa's Historic Resources Inventory by removing 3 properties from the current Inventory. 1514 Clay Street, 1512 Fourth Street, and 801 Coombs Street were found to be ineligible for federal, State or local historic designation.

Chair McCollister pulled this item off Consent for discussion. Senior Planner Eberle reported on the recommended removal of these properties.

Chair McCollister opened the public testimony period.

Kevin Teague noted that there are several other addresses associated with the building at 801 Coombs Street and requested that all the addresses be referenced in the resolution.

Noting no additional comments, the Chair closed the public testimony period and asked for Commissioner questions and comments.

Commissioner Watter said that having been in the building at 801 Coombs Street, she concurred that the considerable number of alterations to this structure jeopardized its historic integrity.

In regards to 801 Coombs Street, Commissioner Nicol asked what type of new construction could be considered on the site. Staff responded that the City's design guidelines would help dictate future building designs and require consideration of compatibility with surrounding buildings.

Chair McCollister and Commissioner Watter stated their reservations that a precedent might be set to allow these buildings to be torn down. Commissioner Watter also said that the building at 1512 Fourth Street appeared to have high historic value with its unique design incorporating the corner entrance and "witches hat" roof. Senior Planner Eberle said that these properties were evaluated by professionals as part of the recent Downtown Historic Survey and determined that they do not meet the criteria necessary to be included on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. Eberle explained that if the property is removed from the Inventory, there would be no discretion involved by the City in the issuance of a demolition permit.

Commissioner Watter said she thought the house on Clay Street was in pretty decent shape. She then asked if it were possible to tear it down one of these buildings and construct a multi-unit apartment building, to which Eberle replied that was possible under the zoning of the properties.

The Commission expressed concern that three properties were combined in this one application. Senior Planner Eberle said the Commission could address each of the three properties individually, and decide which of the three properties should be removed from the Inventory.

Commissioners Songer/Watter moved and seconded to:

1. Close the public hearing.
2. Determine that this project is exempt from the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15305 (Categorical Exemptions; Class 5) of the CEQA Guidelines, which exempts minor alterations to existing land use limitations.

Motion carried 5-0.

A motion by Chair McCollister to remove all three properties from the Inventory as recommended by staff failed for lack of a second.

Commissioners Watter/ moved and seconded to:

Remove the property at 801 Coombs Street property from the Historic Resources

Inventory while retaining the 1512 Fourth Street and 1514 Clay Street properties on the Historic Resources Inventory.

Motion carried 3-2 (McCollister, Nicol opposed)

**7. PUBLIC HEARINGS / APPEALS:**

**A. 1113 PEAR TREE LANE REMOVAL FROM INVENTORY** No. 12-0120 (City of Napa)

Request to remove the property at 1113 Pear Tree Lane from the City's Historic Resources Inventory. The property currently contains a single-family dwelling, and has a Map Score of 3 on the Historic Resources Inventory. It is neither a Neighborhood Conservation Property nor a Landmark Property. The property is located on the south side of Pear Tree Lane, approximately 350 feet east of Beard Road within the BP-441, Business Professional General Plan designation and the OM, Medical Office zoning district. (APN 044-040-013)

Senior Planner Eberle presented the report.

Commissioners commented on the poor condition of this home. Staff confirmed that the property is not in an historic district.

Commissioners Van Giesen/Watter moved and seconded to:

1. Close the public hearing.
2. Determine that the project is exempt from the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15305 of the CEQA Guidelines, which exempts minor alterations in land use limitations.
3. Accept the required findings and move to remove the property at 1113 Pear Tree Lane from the Historic Resources Inventory.

Motions carried 5-0.

**8. ADMINISTRATIVE REPORTS:**

None.

**9. BRIEF COMMENTS BY COMMISSION MEMBERS OR PLANNING STAFF:**

- Commissioner Van Giesen recommended that Commissioners tour the Borreo Building.
- Van Giesen commented on the preservation of the Merrill's building located within the Shops at Napa Center.
- Van Giesen noted that Napa County Landmarks is holding their annual Holiday Candlelight Tour and Christmas Bazaar on December 8th.

**10.ADJOURNMENT: 5:48 PM**

---

Heather McCollister, Chair  
CITY OF NAPA  
CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

---

Kevin Eberle, Secretary  
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT  
DEPARTMENT - PLANNING DIVISION